VETS AGAINST LIVE EXPORT

17 November 2014

Addendum to VALE Analysis of High Mortality Voyage 46

***MV Bader III* Adelaide and Fremantle to Qatar and UAE, August-September 2013**

Complex maritime data pertaining to the *MV Bader III* for 5 September 2013 and 6 September 2013 has been obtained by VALE. A summary of the data is as follows:

The callsign data from *MV Bader III* indicate that the ship maintained maximum speed (approximately 14 knots) within the Persian Gulf from Kish Island until approximately 40 nautical miles from Doha at 1134 hours UTC (Co-ordinated Universal Time) or 1434 AST (Arabia Standard time).

The AAV noted in the EOV report page 2 that "sheep travelled well in good conditions until within 6 hours sailing to Doha at 10 am but on page 3 wrote that "At 11.30 am on 6 September, with the ship …90 nautical miles (6 hours sailing time from Doha) …". The AAV does not state in his report which time zone[1] was used for his records and report although it is obvious, that unless the ship was stationary or circling, it could not have been 6h from Doha at both 10am and 11.30am. The vessel does not appear to have been 90 nautical miles from Doha at 1130 hours as written in the AAV's EOV report if the AAV was using UTC.

Around midday UTC, on 6 September 2013, the vessel altered course to the south, deviating from its original direct bearing of approximately 240 degrees between Kish Island and Doha. An hour later, a further shift to the south occurred and this was followed by an apparent reduction in speed. By mid-afternoon, the ship maintained a steady position, approximately 15 to 18 nautical miles offshore from Doha harbour; livestock vessel would not have been visible to an observer at Doha port at this position even on a clear day. The reported speeds from 1325 hours to 1632 hours UTC range from 4 knots to <1 knot respectively. The vessel appears to have been essentially stationary between 1500 hours and 1530 hours UTC, the time listed for the significant sheep mortality in the AAV's EOV report but with time zone not

[1] Within the Persian Gulf at the time of the transit of the MV Bader III in September 2013, there were three time zones that may have been used for local time on the ship. It is customary practice on ships to advance or retard the local time during the night and apply a consistent time zone during the day. Qatar uses Arabia Standard time = UTC + 3 hours. Gulf standard time is UTC plus 4.0 hours. Kish Island is on Iranian daylight time = UTC +3.5 hours. UTC times are thus 3-4 hour behind local times.

> referenced. Around 1630 hours UTC, the vessel increased speed and headed to port, finally docking around 2015 hours UTC, approximately 8 hours after its initial change of course. A distance of 40 nautical miles at 14 knots should take approximately 3 hours.

The EOV report does not define the time zone used which is inadequate in a region that operates off three potential time zones (separate from UTC). However, neither the EOV report nor the Department of Agriculture's investigation report mention a delayed approach of the *MV Bader III* to Doha, on 6 September 2013, the day of the extreme mortality incident. Given the potential time discrepancies, it is not possible to determine whether the vessel was stationary or moving at the time of the high mortality incident. If the ship was stationary at the time of the alleged extreme weather incident it is implausible that sheep on the enclosed decks were worse affected than those on open decks.