

# VALE COMMENTS on Report 1 Maysora Turkey April 2018

## Mortality

Sheep mortality much lower than historic average

## Feed and water

IO SUMMARY "Sufficient feed (pellets and chaff) were provided for the voyage based on a 19 day sailing time, plus seven day contingency."

### VALE COMMENT:

This voyage a 29 day voyage so it appears that inadequate food was loaded. Even the Fremantle start of loading to Turkey end of unloading was 22 days.

IO SUMMARY "The IO reported that there was a problem with the pellets tending to go to powder (fines), which lacked fibre and was unpalatable particularly to the sheep. The CO responded by discarding the powdered pellets if the sheep refused to eat it, incurring losses of 7 tons on one occasion. The livestock export company are aware of the problem and they have followed up with the feed manufacturer. The issue was appropriately noted and managed by the CO and the corrective actions were appropriate. "

### VALE COMMENT:

Given the importance of adequate high quality ration, especially for this extra long haul voyage, then there appear to have been major food issues for this voyage. Issues with powdered food also appear in other reports indicating that despite over 30 years of live export, food quality issues persist.

FOI DOCUMENT: The [redacted – presumably AAV] was not provided a nutritional profile of the pellets of chaff. Altering or mixing the chaff and pellets is a significant tool for the [redacted] in managing heat stress

## Temperature

IO SUMMARY: The IO described that temperature and humidity data indicated that the voyage from Fremantle to Tekirdag had three distinct stages. By Day 9, the wet bulb temperature (calculated from dry bulb temperature and humidity) was close to 28 WBT for both sheep and cattle. The ship zig zagged in the Gulf of Aden to capture some cross wind.

VALE COMMENT: these temperatures occur even in northern hemisphere spring

FOI DDOCUMENT: there were significant problems noted with the monitoring of temperature and both dry and wet bulb temperatures "at some stages in this voyage were questionable".

The IO noted that readings are taken every 6 hours but the 3pm readings by the IO were often hotter than 12 pm.

## Health and welfare

IO SUMMARY: "Between Day 9 and Day 20, conditions were harsher as the vessel moved toward the Equator (Day 13) and to the Gulf of Aden (Day 15). The sea temperatures reached 30 degrees Celsius on Day 12... Sheep water consumption increased from 3.0 to 3.5 litres/head/day between Day 9 and Day 20 of the voyage. **During this stage more than 90 per cent of sheep were observed to be slightly panting (closed mouth), and around 5 to 7 per cent were observed to be panting more rapidly with occasional mouth opening.** Only one per cent exhibited sustained open mouth

panting. **An estimated 30 per cent of the cattle, mostly pastoral, were observed to be slightly panting (closed mouth), 65 per cent were observed to be panting more rapidly with occasional mouth opening, with the remaining 5 per cent (only British or European breeds) observed to be panting more rapidly with occasional mouth opening, but no tongue extension.**

**VALE COMMENT:**

At least 5-7% sheep seem to be in panting score 2 which corresponds to moderate heat stress (heat stress threshold 2) with some in severe heat stress (heat stress threshold 3). The AVA submission on heat stress recommended that sheep should never be exposed to HST 3 and that sheep should not be exposed to HST 2 for more than 3 consecutive days where there is no diurnal variation in temperature. It would appear from the information available that there was continuous heat stress for 11 days affecting all sheep to some degree. The conditions were sufficiently severe that even the pastoral cattle (very heat tolerant) showed increased panting scores.

IO SUMMARY: "All of the sheep deaths were attributed to the syndrome inanition/pneumonia"

VALE COMMENT: there is no syndrome of inanition/pneumonia regularly reported. The syndrome reported is variably referred to as inanition/salmonellosis or persistent inappetence-*salmonellosis-inanition* (PSI).

IO SUMMARY "From Day 21, sheep respiration returned to a normal resting pattern with no panting observed. The cattle generally brightened up and the mud on cattle and cattle pen floors in the lower decks started to dry."

VALE COMMENT: this improvement in animal welfare was after 11 days of heat stress .

FOI Document: In answer to the question can 50% of stock lie down at one time, the answer was "mostly"

VALE COMMENT: the fact that <50% of stock can lie down at one time in some pens is concerning in light of the increased stocking density. The 17.5% stocking reduction appears to have been inadequate to allow at least 50% of animals to lie down at one time.

**Representative photos**

**VALE COMMENT**

Despite having moderate to severe heat stress affecting sheep and cattle for 11 days, the photos show that there were no issues identified. The text is clearly at odds with these photos.

**VALE ADDITIONAL COMMENTS**

The Summary Report obtained under FOI is heavily redacted including the section on DAWR Relationship with AAV.

The IO noted that there were some errors in the daily reports including cattle hospital pen count and that these were rectified on being pointed out.

The IO noted that there were no written records of an animal/individual identity on entering and leaving hospital pens which is noteworthy as a) the AAV on High Mortality Voyage 39 was referred to the DPP (Director of Public Prosecutions) for not identifying the sick cattle treated in hospital pens and b) there is no way of recording antibiotic treatment which is relevant for withholding periods in slaughter animals at end destination.