



Dr Mark Schipp
Department of Agriculture
GPO Box 858
CANBERRA
ACT 2601

Cc Mr Phillip Glyde, Dr Julia Nicholls

by email: info@vale.org.au

14 August 2014

Dear Dr Schipp,

Attached is VALE's analysis of the information in the public domain on High Mortality Voyage 46, from Adelaide to Fremantle, Doha and Jebel Ali in August and September 2013. The analysis does not support the conclusion that the high mortality was due solely to an extreme weather incident. The worst mortality was in the enclosed, mechanically ventilated decks. The cattle on this same voyage experienced no mortality due to the asserted extreme weather incident. A problem with mechanical ventilation on the enclosed sheep decks is considered likely.

Also attached is an addendum pertaining to maritime data that VALE cannot verify for accuracy. The shipping information in the addendum, if verified, would further support VALE's concerns about this incident.

VALE does not have recourse to the redacted data or emails from the Department of Agriculture to the exporters. We are also not privy to any documentation surrounding the Department's investigation of this voyage. However, the records of the AQIS Accredited Veterinarian on this voyage do not stand up well to close scrutiny. There are inaccuracies, omissions and discrepancies. The government's investigation report does not acknowledge that any such issues were noted or provide any reason for them however, unless a government veterinarian had been available and able to dedicate the same 30-40 hours to auditing that VALE has done, it would have been easy to overlook some of the discrepancies.

There may be legitimate reasons for the discrepant and seemingly inaccurate veterinary records from this voyage and the failure to advise of a notifiable incident but we would request that you, as Australia's Chief Veterinary Officer, investigate the record keeping and reports from this voyage.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'S Foster', written in a cursive style.

Dr Sue Foster BVSc MVetClinStud FANZCVS
Spokesperson, Vets Against Live Export