VALE COMMENT ON REPORT 20 to Israel, September 2018

Mortality

IO SUMMARY: "One of these mortalities were [was = correct grammar] linked to a failure to select appropriate cattle or identify them for rejection prior to loading."

VALE COMMENT: the report indicates that 2 mortalities were likely due to this: one hospitalized shortly after loading with non-responsive lameness (potentially pre-existing) and one not meeting importing country requires

IO SUMMARY: "The department referred this issue to the exporter and they have since submitted a non-conformance and rectification report to the department that details procedures to minimise the likelihood of a reoccurrence of this issue on future voyages."

VALE COMMENT: if there had not been an IO onboard, would this have been reported?

Daily routine

IO SUMMARY: Recordings of temperature were taken every four hours on all decks and a daily average recorded for each deck.

VALE COMMENT: it is interesting that multiple temperature recordings are made on ME longhaul voyages but not on "shorthaul" voyages which include voyages of equal or longer length to China. It is also worth noting a comment by a different IO (Report 10) on this same vessel:

"Temperatures were recorded every four hours by the crew with a handheld device and averages were collated for the daily report. There were also wet/dry bulbs on each deck to observe real time temperature. The IO felt that given an average was being reported that this did not reflect the daily maximum temperature and humidity levels.

Ventilation

IO SUMMARY: The ventilation on the vessel was very good overall, however one issue was observed. An intake tower located very close to open engine room doors increased temperatures in pens behind the engine room on decks five, six and seven, especially when there was a following wind. Conditions in these pens were not bad on this relatively cool voyage. The department will monitor this on future voyages in warmer periods.

VALE COMMENT: this was not noted in Report 10 suggesting a different IO.

Pen conditions

IO SUMMARY: The cattle handled the voyage very well, however when water consumption and faecal matter production increased, it became more difficult to keep pens clean despite application of saw dust and chaff. This was particularly evident on lower/enclosed decks.

VALE COMMENT: there is no mention of the wet or dry bulb temperatures on this voyage at all and no mention of heat stress. The fact that water consumption increased indicates a possibility of hotter conditions and potentially heat stress although the IO commented: "At no time were there signs of distress or increased respiratory rate due to heat stress."

Representative Photos

VALE COMMENT: no issues were noted in representative photo on Day 1 despite the fact that this was a longhaul voyage and there was no bedding in the "representative photo". This is a clear non-

compliance with ASEL and suggests that the IO for this voyage was not familiar with ASEL. Any comment regarding conformance to ASEL may be inaccurate.