VALE COMMENTS on Report 23 MV *Ganado Express* Cattle exported to China in October 2018

Report 23 produced December 2018 - a very short turnaround for report

Daily routine

Temperatures were recorded once daily in mid-morning with a whirling hygrometer to go on the daily report at midday.

VALE COMMENT: once daily measurements mid-morning are not likely to be representative of peak temperature and humidity

Pen conditions

More than half the cattle (sometimes nearly all) were able to recumbent at all times. VALE COMMENT: stocking density was unlikely sufficient for all animals to lie together at one time.

Pad conditions were very challenging on this journey due to the hot and humid conditions with multiple washings being performed to maintain cleanliness.

VALE COMMENT: there is no mention of heat stress on this voyage despite the statement that heat and humidity (and pad conditions) were challenging. No WBTs were provided.

Representative Photos

Given the difficult pad conditions, the photos provided would not appear to be representative of the difficulties encountered.

More than half of the stock in any pen were able to be recumbent at any one time, and there $\ensuremath{\mathbf{3}}$

Representative photographs of the

Day 1 Cattle in pen—no issues identified

VOyage Day 0 Cattle in pen—no issues identified

Day 8 Cattle in pen-no issues identified

Day 14 Cattle in pen—no issues identified

Day 9 Cattle in pen—no issues identified Day 15 Cattle in pen—no issues identified