

VALE COMMENT ON REPORT 8 on MV Maysora

Sheep and cattle exported to Turkey in June 2018

Report 8, January 2019

Voyage Summary

- closed (6 below Main deck 7) and open (Decks 7-11) deck ship
- 68039 sheep and 3008 cattle to Turkey
- May 31 to June 21, 2018 22 days
- 0.23% mortality sheep (155)
- 0% cattle

Loading

IO SUMMARY: the IO observed that with the new stocking densities there was actually a large amount of unoccupied space in most pens due to the animals tendency to mob together. More than half of the stock in any pen were able to lie down at any one time.

VALE COMMENT: can all the stock lie down at one time (50% is not consistent with OIE guidelines)

IO ACTUAL REPORT: the IO noted “the incredible amount of space left within sheep pens that was not being used up by the animals; and the various sheep and cattle behaviours that have not been considered under the blanket allometric stocking density values provided in the McCarthy Review. Animal welfare should evolve through well researched evidence-based science; and policies should be carefully made in-line with this evidence instead of immediate reactions to public outcry.”

VALE COMMENT: is the the comment of a careful observer or a very biased DAWR employee who “had the pleasure of being indulged in the intricacies of the live export trade to the Middle East”?

IO ACTUAL REPORT: “it can be seen that on paper, 90% of all sheep pens provided the required (or excess) amount of space for the class of animals within the pens. The 10% that came under were only under by an average of 0.09m²/head. This is not significant given that visually, it was observed that all animals within all pens had excessive amounts of space during this voyage.

VALE COMMENT: 0.09m²/head is quite a significant space given the individual space allowance for sheep at least. It is commendable that there appeared to be adequate space but the failure of an IO to understand the significance of 0.09m²/head (ie 1/3 of the original space allocated to a 47kg sheep under ASEL

namely 0.27 m2) is concerning.

IO ACTUAL REPORT: "They seem not to be bothered with physical contact with each other, unlike in pigs (where allometric densities of 0.033k values have been studied) and seem to prefer lying down next to each other in close contact. They also appear to huddle together in a group when seas are rough appearing to support each other. "

VALE COMMENT: pigs on a ship subject to ship movement, constant noise and light may also choose to lie together so comparison is invalid and seems to have been made to indicate that the suggested k values are inappropriate.

Daily Routine

VALE COMMENT: Temperatures were taken on each desk with fixed hygrometers and unlike Report 1 on the same ship, with the same IO, this time they were working according to the IO ACTUAL REPORT.

VALE COMMENT: unlike on the Bader, this IO noted no problems during Ramadan with respect to level of care.

Ventilation

IO SUMMARY: the IO noted that only a certain percentage of sheep will be demonstrating certain panting scores within a pen at any given time.

IO ACTUAL REPORT: "Panting scores for cattle did not exceed 2.5 during this voyage" and "The maximum panting score reached by sheep was 2 and by cattle was 2.5 on Day 15 and 16."

VALE COMMENT: These panting scores indicate HST has been exceeded for some animals for at least 2 days.

IO ACTUAL REPORT: "about 50% of animals within a pen displaying a panting score of 1 by Day 5." ..."From Day 5 the conditions were a bit warmer and humid as the vessel moved toward the Equator (Day 9) to the Gulf of Aden (Day 12). There was only 1 day within this time where a maximum of 33°C and humidity of 79% was reached. This was the maximum reached for the entire voyage (Day 15). "...these temperatures are almost exactly similar to the last voyage..."rain between Days 9-11 and stronger winds and gale between Days 12-13 allowing for a much cooler than normal second stage of the journey"...

IO ACTUAL REPORT: "As the vessel moves into the Gulf of Aden...Sheep: During this stage more than 95% of sheep displayed panting scores of 1 within a pen whilst only 5% would demonstrate scores of 2. There would be an occasional animal with mouth open breathing but even this would be interrupted with

...Cattle: 90% of cattle had panting scores rise to 1 during this stage. The rest of the 10% (mainly European breeds) displayed between 1.5-2.5 Respiration rates within the European breeds elevated from 35 breaths/min to about 50 breaths/min between days 13-15. Respiratory rates within the pastorals were generally between 40-45 breaths/min even during this period.”

VALE COMMENT: heat stress seems to have been reasonably continuous on both Maysora voyages, albeit this voyage was somewhat cooler. The IO makes an interesting observation that during heat stress sheep prefer to stand, probably to dissipate heat better and that once heat conditions resolve, “75% of the pen would be lying down”.

IO ACTUAL REPORT: “It was questioned during these conversations why DAWR was attempting to regulate PAT systems implemented in vessels already approved by AMSA as AMSA is the regulating body that has the expertise to assess the technicalities of these system.

VALE COMMENT: perhaps it is because AMSA cant assess the hot spots of the ship – they do their analyses in unloaded ships. Fig 5 in the IO report shows fans at identified “hot spots” so clearly PAT does not cover ventilation issues onboard ships. Likewise the IO later refers to the fact that “pockets of hot air gets built up within Deck 5 and 6 unable to be exhausted out creating heat within the main hold of these decks.”

Pen conditions

IO SUMMARY: The wash down plan, which is usually performed every four days on cattle decks wasn’t performed for the first time until day 8 of this voyage. This was due to the conditions being deemed acceptable at day 4 and day 6 and also an overloading of feed in fore compartments of the ship. The additional feed in the fore meant that the required trim for safe operation of the ship during washing could be attained until after day 8.

VALE COMMENT: it is contrary to Marine Orders 43 for a vessel to sail with a trim that does not allow appropriate drainage from pens at washdown. The IO was obviously unaware that it was contrary to MO 43.

Feed and Water

IO SUMMARY There was a large amount of powdered feed left in stores from the previous voyage [REPORT 1]. The AAV instructed that this be removed as much as possible from troughs on each feeding and used to keep pens dry to that animals had access to pelletised feed.

VALE: given that this had been identified as a problem in Report 1, it would seem to be poor management that this powdered food had not been removed. It is evident from the IO ACTUAL REPORT that this powdered food was fed until mid journey when the freshly loaded pellets were fed. Given that sheep especially do not tolerate powdered food well, there appears to have been lack of appropriate food provision on this ship despite the problem being noted on an earlier voyage.

Health and Welfare

IO SUMMARY REPORT: THE IO did not note any health and welfare issues.

IO ACTUAL REPORT: "Euro being most expensive, British next and Pastoral the cheapest [redacted but presumably as per Report 1 Maysora May 2018]. As mentioned in [redacted] report, the breeds that handled the journey the best were roughly in the reverse order.

IO ACTUAL REPORT: All of the sheep deaths were attributed to the syndrome inanition/pneumonia.

VALE COMMENT: as per Report 1, there is no such syndrome. Presumably the IO means inanition/salmonellosis?

IO ACTUAL REPORT: 6 lambs were born in total over the voyage

VALE COMMENT: this indicates failure of compliance with ASEL. The IO Summary made no mention of the lambs

Discharge

IO SUMMARY: no problems

IO ACTUAL REPORT: "If they [ill animals] still show clinical issues at discharge time, but are evaluated as being able to safely and humanely walked [IO spelling] out the ramp, then they are kept separate and discharged as a group of hospital animals at the end of discharge.

Representative photographs

IO SUMMARY: no issues identified in any photograph

VALE COMMENT: DAWR appears to have sanitised this report