

VALE SUMMARY OF NOTES FROM THE DAILY IO CHECKLIST AND DAILY NOTES FROM IO3

Bader; sheep and cattle to Israel May 2018

Note: Handwriting was not always legible and redactions were in place. Where obvious spelling/typographical mistakes made in these reports, they have been corrected. The maximum temperature was not always designated as wet bulb temperature (WBT) but given the consistency in daily reporting, the designation of WBT on some days and the individual deck WBT's, it is assumed that in each case the maximum temperature provided is WBT. However, where the IO has clearly indicated WBT, the designation has been included. Any explanatory notes from VALE are in square brackets. Any questions (designated Q) are standard questions from the daily DAWR checklist – only questions with unusual answers were provided in the summary.

Day 1: 4.5.18

Max temp: 24° main deck

Max humidity: 72% Deck 5

IO notes that images/video captured but difficult

Day 2: 5.5.18

Max temp: 26-25° main deck;

Max humidity: 84% main deck

5 sheep mortalities in the past 24 hour period. The Awassi in the garage of the ship were by far the most comfortable with the conditions in the garage being today 3-4 degrees cooler than outside.

There is one area where the pen pad condition is sub par main deck pen 12 port side. The pad is building up under the trough. Ship is aware and it is scheduled to be shovelled out. This is Awassi rams

Day 3: 6.5.18

Max temp: 30° WBT

Max humidity: 92%;

WBT for Deck 5 28°, Deck 4 29°, Deck 3 29°, Deck 2 28°, Main Deck 27°, Deck A 28°, Deck B 27°, Deck C 27°, Deck D 27°, Deck E 28°, Garage 26°

Spelling/writing illegible but appears that pen conditions for Awassi rams were very different from Merino, X bred and Awassi ewes (with ?pugging and plan to shovel out half and add sawdust);

Shyfeeder sheep treated [**VALE COMMENT: this was despite the fact that inanition not being noted as an issue in Summary Report or IO report summary**]; Draxxin for respiratory infection Issues found – the heavy Rams were a little panty in the middle areas of the main deck. These are big rams around 70 kg. They were not distressed but a bit panty compared to yesterday.

Same comments re pad

Areas of possible heat retention have started to be identified and extra fans are being wired into place. "Today has been likened to equatorial conditions"

Day 4: 7.5.18

Max temp: 28°

Max humidity: 85%;

WBT Deck 5 26°, Deck 4 26°, Deck 3, 26°, Deck 2, 27°, Main Deck 28, ° Deck A 28°, Deck B 28°, Deck C 28°, Deck D 27°, Deck E 27°, Garage 26°.

Regarding pad Awassi rams still different

1 sheep mortality.

There is a sick pen with around 9 sheep of various issues from snotty noses to lame or shyfeeders with close [redacted] oversight.

Cattle need a washdown. Some of the pens are getting quite mucky. Not a real problem yet but needs to be done tomorrow. It has been an interesting observation as to how the ability to wash out the cattle pens is so dependent on other outside factors like the inclination of the ship to allow drainage eg: it must be bow up and to be able to be listed to one side a bit. Also the overriding issues of where at sea this washing can be performed. eg ; close to land, in the straits etc are all not allowed. The [redacted] are already having to work backwards from arrival in Eilat Israel to ensure the cattle are as clean as possible and best presented on arrival.

[VALE COMMENT: it is evident that it is important to present well in Israel where animal activists have been very vocal about the state of the animals on arrival]

Day 5: 8.5.18

Max temp: 30°

Max humidity: 92%

Q: Are these readings occurring at the same time each day.

Answer – they vary; today max humidity and temperature ~13.30.

Deck 4 27°, Deck 3 27°, Deck 2 28°, Main Deck 28°, Deck A 29°, Deck B 29°, Deck C 28°, Deck D 28°, Deck E 28°, Garage 28°

Re pad: Awassi sheep putty-like ~3-4 cm deep; “when water leaks the pad is shovelled out and sawdust applied;

Q: Is the ventilation in the pens adequate?

Answer: It was reduced today then ship began to ZIG ZAG to increase airflow which worked well.

Zigzagged once hit 30 degrees due to following wind.

Shyfeeders still being treated.

3 sheep mortalities in the last 24 hours.

Some of the sheep especially on main deck big rams but others were just starting to show signs of open mouth breathing at 30 WBT however this quickly stopped with the course change. This occurred at 13.30. The humidity increased quite significantly during the morning.

Cattle washout has started today. Washdown from now will be repeated in a 3 day cycle. 2 to wash then 1 rest repeat. The angus that went down yesterday died quickly. Post mortem showed it not to be acute infectious pneumonia

(the [redacted] is a New Zealander who speaks with a “thuck accent and very fast with great intensity I often have to slow him down and him repeat what he is saying”

The [redacted] is starting to prepare what he calls a wellness pen for shy feeders in the corner of each deck to house potential poorer cattle then they turn up. There few yet but the [redacted] and [redacted] frequently repeat that these start to show up much more clearly after day 8-9 of a voyage. [Redacted] requested this pen to be on the outside of vessel for increased air flow.

Day 6: 9.5.18

Max temp: 31°

Max humidity: 92%.

Q: Are the readings occurring at the same time each day?

Answer: No – depending on sun and ships ZIG ZAG course will alter timing.

The main waterfeed lines to each deck are turned off individually to clean the water troughs 5-10 minutes per line OK.

Q: Have there been any issues with the ventilations system?

Answer: Fan in duct B24 broke down placed and A32 having intermittent problems – fixed quickly when alarm goes off

“the sheep in the lower level pen seem more [illegible] increased shade.

Pad doughy in some esp Awassi.

Q: Are mortalities being accurately recorded and reported?

Answer: Y “there was one extra sheep [illegible] for crew found not recorded on morbidity sheep today Awassi.

Q: Are there any other comments regarding conditions or any other aspect worthy of note?

Answer “the [redaction] has been involved for the last 5-6 days much earlier than normal”

[VALE COMMENT: is the redaction AAV? Ship Master? If AAV, this comment is concerning]

Sea temperature is now 30 and humidity is 85-95%

Sheep – the sheep were uniformly well; there have been around 12 mortalities and 1 awassi for crew to eat slaughtered – 13 in total in the past 24 hour period. 2 were euthanized....rest died. Causes unclear.

[VALE COMMENT: IO notes elsewhere that no sheep necropsies were done. If this is the case, this indicates that AAV is not appropriately investigating, especially if there were no obvious gross causes]

There has been no real sign of heat stress of any significance. There is a very small amount of mouth breathing mostly in the merino type sheep. This looks to just be ventilating to reduce heat and not significant heat stress because as soon as I approach the all stop to look at me and breath normally through their noses. With genuine severe heat stress they cannot change their concentration and will continue to mouth breathe whatever the stimulus.

[VALE COMMENT: this is only true for very severe heat stress. Sheep are a “prey animal” and will do their best to hide illness/weakness. The IO seems poorly informed re heat stress/panting scores and animal behaviour. Open mouth breathing is a sign of severe heat stress in sheep.]

The fans rigged over the big rams seems to have helped and they were better today. Some of the outside pads are a little more putty like but still no issue. In general the cattle are pretty good.

“Again I note that given the mind set I could make even the best of journeys look bad with selective imagery.”

[VALE COMMENT: is this a defensive comment implying any footage shown on other voyages eg the 60 Minutes exposé, were selective?]

“This journey according to discussions despite the early onset of equatorial conditions is really going quite well. Mortality so far is low and general flock health good. The [redacted] has commented how much room the stock have this trip.”

[VALE COMMENT: this ship has reportedly been travelling with 10% less stocking density due to the extreme high mortality voyage in 2013 yet the AAV or stockman has commented on how much space the sheep have. An extra 7.5% (17.5-10) in space should not be so very obvious suggesting that the Bader normally travels with a stocking density higher than it is supposed to OR that the stocking density had been reduced by more 17.5%. Dr Lynn Simpson, former AAV, has commented that the stocking rates on recent photos would be much lower than the stocking rates she routinely observed – 17.5% ie that stocking rates have always been higher than ASEL OR that they had been reduced more than 17.5% for independent observer voyages. The AAVs themselves are not privy to actual stocking density calculations so would have no way of knowing whether routine densities were accurate]

Day 7: 10.5.18

Q: Are you OK

Answer: “You betcha”

Max temp 31°

Max humidity 92%; readings several times/day.

Q: Are there issues with animals accessing feed and water?

Answer: Y Occasionally the stockmen forget to turn the water back on for a pen or 2 after cleaning the water troughs and the sheep sometimes [illegible] minutes to ½ hour.

Re pad conditions: With the increased humidity and temp the water intake has increased and urinating more the pad consistency has gone from dry and friable to some have a more doughy consistency (NOT ALL)

“fans have been added to the big ram pens”

Q: Have euthansed animals been counted and recorded separately from those found dead?

Answer Y But not specific numbers

“There were more signs of heat related issues today. Nothing really major but general panting was up and there were even signs of increased respiratory [rate] in the on deck Awassi. All the sheep are drinking more and urinating more so overall there has been an increase in the tackiness of the pads overall. Around 5.30pm one of the cattle tag 2858 being treated for lameness and mild resp issue

collapsed and died. Necropsy showed little inside but the carcass was extremely hot to touch. Heat related death. This was on deck A where the pm WBT reached 31.”

Issues noted – “on my lunch time rounds there were several water troughs without water and one sheep 4 way line was turned off and 2 troughs dry because [of it]. I turned it back on and sought the [redacted] and the [redacted] to report this finding for remedial action. It was oversight but with equatorial type conditions water is the most vital issue. “

“The ship is still zigzagging every 3 hours as we still have the unfortunate following wind. In general still hot and humid. Animals faring pretty well but the heat is having more of a present today than before.”

Day 8: 11.5.18

Max temp 31°

Max humidity 85%

Are these occurring at the same time each day. Y several times/day [4 encircled]

“water intake has increased animals are drinking a lot ~60 T/day ship can make 75 T/day [illegible];

Pads have continued to increase in their moisture content. Most are thick dog like in their consistency from the sheep and thin very liquid for cattle. Cattle pads are only faeces and we have an every 48 hour wash down program. Increase cattle wash to every 48 hrs. Sheep [illegible, perhaps D12] in 5 cm deep”

“despite the constant high temp and humidity the stock are going very well

9 sheep mortalities in the past 24 hours.

“A carcass went over the side at 13.30 from what looked like deck 4. It did not look like it had been abdominally opened but I cannot be sure. Usually the dead sheep are disposed of around late morning after the [redacted] has seen them. I will discuss with the [redacted] as to when they exactly go over and re-clarify with him the exact procedure.”

[VALE COMMENT: it is possible given this comment that not all sheep deaths were recorded but no further reference to this incident is available]

“Still zigzagging. Particular attention is also being paid to the morning sun on the starboard side and the evening sun on the port side. This has the effect of making those pens hotter during these periods. There were no more signs of heat related issues today than yesterday. All the sheep are drinking more and urinating more so overall there has been an increase in the tackiness of the pads overall. The cattle pads are quite messy with liquid faeces/pad. The cattle are drinking a lot and passing a lot so the pens are getting quite sloppy quite quickly. Also the cattle are getting dirty. This is why the [redacted] and [redacted] agreed to a 2 day cycle through these equatorial regions to stop and build up and keep the cattle happier. There are still a couple of gates down on the floors of some cattle pens. This was raised 2 days ago but there are still some around. There seems to be an area of demarcation where the [redacted] for company rules will not go into the cattle pens. The [redacted] will but they have not moved the gates? “

Re the cattle: “They are deeply asleep in the excrement and perfectly happy...and for all the world they look dreadful but they are fine. Again I have taken photos and video of these and they could be made to look dramatic but we only have deeply asleep cattle. “

“the heat is having more of a presence today than before.”

Day 9: 12.5.18

Max temp 32°

Max humidity 85%; very high WBT this am ~6am with 32°C. Stock good at this time no real HS [heat stress] problems.

Pad conditions: Sheep thick dog like ~ 5cm deep no problems with them; Cattle thin muddy liquid mostly faeces and is being hosed out thoroughly and cattle washed every second day.

“Inanition, skinny” identified as health issues

Average wbt on the ship is still hovering around 30° (28-32).

“4 sheep with mild eye infections. His plan is not treat them at present as they are not bad and he feels that due to the stress of the weather conditions at the present that too much fiddling about with them will cause more trouble than the eyes. His plan is that anything with only one eye inflamed will be left. If any develop bilateral problems they will have to be removed to the hospital pen and will be treated

Day 10: 13.5.18

Max temp 30° WBT

Max humidity 86% There are several readings per day.

Pads from sheep have become more boggy in the upper deck 5 & 4 outer pens due to the heavy rain O/N [overnight] still ~5cm no problem some have been shovelled & some sawdust Problem due to rain and being well managed today.

Q Does the observer agree with the assessment provided by the AAV in the Daily Voyage Report
Answer: Y But today they did not include the lamb birth – see if included tomorrow

Q: Have pregnant ewes been identified on the vessel.
Answer: ? supposed to be no pregnant ewes on ship

Q: Are births and abortions being accurately recorded and reported.
Answer: N today there was found a lamb born to a merino ewe in the merino wethers deck 3. It was found and managed but not recorded in today's AAV report – see tomorrow possible oversight

8 sheep mortalities. “One lamb born overnight to the ewe that somehow snuck into the loaded merino wethers from Fremantle.”

[VALE COMMENT: naughty ewe?]

“We had lots of rain overnight and there is a fair clean up of the upper portside sheep decks required. The consistency of the pens continues to get stickier, still only 6 cm deep max but they are quite tacky. When they get too liquid, they are shovelled out and sawdusted.

“welcome relief from the continuous heat and humidity we have had”

[VALE COMMENT: IO reflects the continuous heat and humidity for May]

“The sheep are still coping very well on the whole with very little issues with real heat stress issues so far in the voyage. I have a copy of the THI from the Veterinary handbook for cattle, sheep and goats with me and I am finding that the suggested levels of the border of severe stress and very severe stress the table suggests is not being represented in this real time study. The table suggests we should for the last 6 days often been seeing very severe h/s but we are not seeing this as the photographic and video footage will show.it has however been very calm which will clearly reduce on =e of the tiring factors for the stock.”

[VALE COMMENT: this IO did not at any stage record panting scores and seems unfamiliar with scoring heat stress as per any of the published scores. It appears as though unless the sheep is in extremis, heat stress is not identified. The fact that the AAV could not risk moving sheep into treatment pens due to the extreme conditions is indicative of the level of heat stress experienced on this ship. The IO may not have appreciated it but the ship personnel obviously did.]

Day 11: 14.5.18:

Max temp 30°

Max humidity 85%; measured 4 times.

Dryer conditions and the [illegible] are drying out to between crumbly and muddy – cattle still boggy liquid but very thin and hosed every 48 hrs.

Q: Does the observer agree with the assessment provided by the AAV in the Daily Voyage Report?
Answer Y/N “The report is mostly fine however the [redacted] forgets to mention that the cattle are being treated for lameness as well.”

“1 lamb in nursery pen with ewe and well managed mother & daughter doing well

6 sheep mortalities.

Day 12 :15.5.18

Max temp 30°

Max humidity 85%.

Pad conditions: crumbly-putty; sheep 6-10 cm. liquid and shallow cattle.

Similar comment re ewe and lamb.

Q: Are there any other comments regarding conditions?

Answer N Yes at 5.30 there was a sudden decrease in the wind and the humidity increased WBT across the ship went up to 30-31°

Day 13 16.5.18

Max temp 31° WBT

Max humidity: 85%

Pads drying out well with drier conditions sheep – friable/crumbly. Cattle still mushy but not [illegible] and every 2nd day wash.

1 lamb and ewe doing well

Day 14: 17.5.18

Q: Are you OK

Answer: "YES BUT LOOKING FORWARD TO THE END (~ 1 week)"

Max temp 31°

Max humidity 85%

lots of Rain O/N [overnight] so pads have increased in water content to muddy/crumbly depending on where [it] is – still good though.

2 lambs new both good and in nursery pens with the ewes.

Q Any other comments?

Answer Y Ramadan slows the workers

Day 15: 18.5.18

Max temp 31°

Max humidity 85%

Q: Are these occurring at the same time each day?

Answer N today the temp spiked pm – was wet cold & very windy AM ~26° WBT

Q: Have there been any issues with the ventilation systems?

Answer Y one of the ventilation fans to cattle [illegible] slowed – fixed very quickly <1hr Water in circuit Broke down [illegible ?gen?] needs replacement.

The upper level pens on Bader have less [illegible] than lower

Q Are the pens in appropriate condition and good order?

Answer N after the storm and torrential rain last night ~1/4 sheep pens are muddy. Crew working on fixing this today shovel and sawdust. From friable – muddy due to severe O/N storm for sheep decks
Cattle – mostly liquid and garage normal – friable

Q: Are mortalities being accurately recorded and reported?

Answer Y yes in number there was an issue with the possible drowning of a bull today – see my daily notes.

"still 2 lambs born to ewe that stowed away with the wethers – both well and cared for well."

Q: Are there any other comments.

Answer: Y Today we had the first instance of major miscommunication with the bull death and disposal see daily notes **[VALE COMMENT: notes for this day do not appear to have made available under FOI]**

Day 16: 19.5.18

Max 34° WBT

Max humidity 95% HUMID.

Q: Are these readings occurring at the same time each day.

Answer N They vary depending on the climatic conditions today early AM.

Pens drying out after storm at BAB. Sheep crumbly to muddy. Cattle boggy liquid not sticky, mostly faeces. Shovel & sawdust cattle wash down.

2 lambs and ewes both well.

Q: Are there any other comments "Today was a severe test of animals/crew/management with WBT of 34 degrees

[VALE COMMENT: this is significantly above the government's heat stress threshold for sheep and close to the currently defined mortality limit: Current Standard Merino sheep: HST 30.6°C; ML 35.5°C]

Day 17:20.5.18

Are you OK? GOOD 1 day from EILAT.

Max temp 31° @ 7pm, 28° most of day

Max humidity 86%

Q: Are animals that require treatment being identified and brought to the attention of the AAV in a timely fashion

Answer N Usually. There was an issue today when a down cow should have been reported to AAV/stockman earlier tag 2248 (died) h/s [heat stress]

Pad conditions: Sheep with improved weather drying out rapidly vary from friable - crumbly – muddy BUT none of a problem that needs fixing.

Q: Are any found dead animals removed from the pens in a timely fashion.

Answer N [or perhaps ~] Not as well as possible today. 2 Bulls were left a bit long due to washdown program and by clean up from heat/storm

2 lambs ad ewe all good.

Day 18: 21.5.18

"GULF OF AQUABA!! [in large upper case writing]."

Are you OK "YEP"

Max temp 30°

Max humidity 85%.

Pad conditions: Sheep friable – thick (big rams) ~12 cm max in centre.

Q: Have any problem pens been identified with respect to pad condition or ventilation?

Answer Y big rams are urinating a lot and pads a bit thick – letting dry out & adding S/D [sawdust]

Management: shovel &S/D

Q: Are any found dead animals removed the pens in a timely fashion?

Answer Y usually though have been 2 dead sheep which [illegible ? were] difficult to see and it took a few days for these. Usually v prompt.

2 lambs & ewes both good.

Other comments?: Y NEARLY IN ISRAEL!!

Day 19: 22.5.18

First page not provided in FOI documents (p294 of 845 proceeds to page 295 of 845 with one page not provided). WBT and humidity thus missing from the FOI data available to VALE.

Pad conditions: Sheep dusty – crumbly (AWASSI & RAMS). Cattle being unloaded this pm

Q: Are any found dead animals removed from the pens in a timely fashion

Answer USUALLY – this has been a bit slower today due to unloading and Ramadan

HAVE 3 LAMBS all in nursery pen [with] ewes

Q: Are there any other comments

Answer: Y It becomes very less well organized and increased stressful unloading and evidently more so in Israel

Day 20: 22.5.18

Max temp 28° Much lower humidity

Max humidity 66%

There were 2 broken pipes on DECK 5 sth side sheep - ~1 hr to fix then OK

Pens Drying out rapidly

[ANOTHER PAGE MISSING FROM RECORD]

Day 21: 23.5.18

Max temp 28°

Max humidity 66% Very dry hot and pleasant for sheep. Cattle all off by [illegible]

“again broken pipe Deck 5 – these sheep were moved down for unloading in EILAT so fixing not needed – no water ~ 40 mins “

“There has been an increased euth [euthanasia] of sheep and cattle due to end of trip and inability to treat a few of these. Euth – 2 bulls – sheep

Pens very good due to dry heat. Sheep dusty-crumbly ~1/4 sheep unloaded all cattle gone

Q: Are any found dead animals removed from the pens in a timely fashion?

Answer: ~. the dead cattle are still in the pens after unloading @1300 decision as to how to handle being taken – should go in hogger but they might struggle with big bulls Wait & see ` all other cattle off

5 lambs now all well and in nursery with ewes

Q: Are there any other comments?

Answer: Y It becomes very disorganized at unload esp with the influence of RAMADAN on crew work ours and conditions

Day 22: 24.5.18 UNLOADING JORDAN

Q: Are you OK?

Answer: none provided

Max temp 25°.

Max humidity 65. On A Deck 11am BY DAWR. [illegible] today sheep moved to A deck and their temps not recorded

Q: Are these readings capturing the maximum temperature/humidity level each day.

Answer: N not today as a deck was missed – the animals are fine as weather is good but not recorded.

Pens Very good – low dry pads ~12 cm max

Pens dusty-friable ~12 cm max

Q: Are any found dead animals....

Answer: ~ a little less quick during unloading due to spread of crew to other duties.

Q: Does the observer agree with the assessment provided by the AAV in the Daily Voyage Report?

Answer :Y exception of no A Deck temps

4 lambs & ewes v good – 2 lambs died O/N – 1 orphan , 1 unclear

Day 23: 25.5.18

Q: Are you OK. No answer recorded but noted that he contacted DAWR at 4 AM!!!

[VALE COMMENT: interesting time for contact to Australian department. One wonders what necessitated a call at such an inconvenient hour]

Max temp 27°

Max humidity 65% still missing DECK A for temps with sheep

Q: Are there issues with animals accessing feed and water?

Answer: Y The attention to the water troughs today during unloading is a bit slack on DECK 5 – some troughs not water. Told [redacted] but they should know. Duration unclear.

[VALE COMMENT: this is not the first time that failure to provide water occurred on this voyage]

Q: Is the equipment monitored and operating efficiently?

Answer: N NOT TODAY

Q: For vessels with split level sheep pens – are all sheep in split level pens being monitored daily?

Answer: Y But not as well during unloading

Pad conditions: dusty – crumbly – v.good ~12 cm deep max

Q: Does the observer agree with the assessment provided by the AAV in the Daily Voyage Report?

Answer: ~ Mostly – he is not really thorough as is prepared by [redacted] and they amend together – poor proof reading before signs

[VALE COMMENT: this indicates that the IO did not think the AAV thorough and there are other comments that suggest criticism eg not recording deck temperatures, disagreements etc. There was not mention of these issues in the official IO summary]

4 lambs well 2 died – cause : 1 orphan -1 ?

Days 24/25: 26.5.18 on 27.5.18

Q: Are you OK? No answer provided.

Max temp: 25° WBT

Max humidity: 65%

Pad dusty/friable @ mostly not empty

Of the 6 lambs born 3 alive – 1 dead – ORPHAN

1 illthrift?

1 trampled

Q: Are there any other comments

Answer N Unloading very slow